

# Governance Standing Group (GSG)

## Minutes and Actions Arising from Meeting Held on 28 January 2010

### Present:

Garth Graham	GG	Chairperson, SSE
Bali Virk	BV	Secretary
Alex Thomason	AT	National Grid Electricity Transmission
Bushra Akhtar	BA	National Grid Electricity Transmission
Kathryn Coffin	KC	ELEXON
Robert Longden	RL	Wind Energy
Merel Van der Neut Kolfshoten	MK	Centrica
Peter Bolitho	PB	E.ON
Stuart Cotten	SC	Drax Power Limited
Barbara Vest	BVe	Association of Electricity Producers

### Apologies:

Tony Dicicco	TD	RWE
--------------	----	-----

All presentations and supporting papers given at this GSG meeting can be found at:  
<http://www.nationalgrid.com/uk/Electricity/Codes/systemcode/workingstandinggroups/gsg/>

## 1 Apologies for Absence & Introductions

183. Apologies were received from Tony Dicicco who informed the GSG Secretary that he is no longer able to be part of the group due to commitments in his new role.
184. The Chairman asked the GSG Secretary to send an email to TD to thank him for his contribution to the GSG.

**Action: BV to send a thank you email to Tony Dicicco**

185. The GSG noted the absence of an Ofgem representative at the GSG meetings. GG would highlight this to Jon Dixon at the January Amendments Panel meeting.

**Action: GG to ask for Ofgem representation at the GSG meeting**

186. BV to update the GSG Terms of Reference to reflect TD's departure, and for the TOR to be forwarded to the CUSC Panel for approval at the February Amendments Panel meeting.

**Action: BV to update TOR and circulate to the Amendments Panel**

## 2 Approval of Minutes

187. The minutes from the meeting held on 26 November 2009 were approved. The minutes will be published on the National Grid website shortly.

**Action: BV to publish minutes on the National Grid website**

## 3 Review of Actions

188. Detailed below is the progress to date on the outstanding actions from previous meetings:

- **Minute 140: Review of Report Templates.** Add an additional question on the Working Group Consultation Response Proforma within the

## Governance Standing Group (GSG)

implementation section of “How long would this take?”. The response pro forma was updated and circulated.

**Action completed**

- GG to inform the Amendments Panel on 27 November that report templates have been reviewed following completion of the CAP160 review.

**Action completed**

- **Minute 153: MK to draft a paper on Voting Best Practice for Working Groups and Amendments Panel**, specifically to cover abstention and voting on a “least worst” option – To be covered under agenda item 4.
- **Minute 158: NGET and KC to consider proposals for Cross Code Forum and present back to the GSG**

KC confirmed that progress had been made with the Cross Codes Forum and details have now been published on the ELEXON and National Grid websites, the forums will be held at ELEXON's offices in London. KC also confirmed details of the Cross Codes Forum will be published in ELEXON's Newscast. The confirmed Cross Codes Forum dates are:

- Friday 19<sup>th</sup> March
- Friday 14<sup>th</sup> May
- Friday 16<sup>th</sup> July
- Friday 17<sup>th</sup> September
- Friday 19<sup>th</sup> November

Further details can be found on ELEXON's website at:

<http://www.elexon.co.uk/bscpanelandcommittees/panelcommittees/crosscodesforum/default.aspx>

PB asked whether the Cross Codes Forum would cover gas issues, KC confirmed to the group that the Cross Codes Forum would cover electricity only.

- **Minute 158 - KC & AT to draft a note to the Trade Associations on the Proposals for the Cross Code Forum for GG to circulate**

**Action completed**

- **Minute 160 – NGET to draft a CUSC Amendment Proposal to enable all interested parties to submit WG Consultation Alternative Requests.**

**To be covered under agenda item 4**

- **Minute 180 – Role of Chair, GSG to prepare a Paper for Amendments Panel outlining the pros and cons associated with each option with a view to presenting the Paper at the February meeting.**

**To be covered under agenda item 4**

- **Minute 180– NGET to produce an Initial written assessment for a complex CUSC Amendment Proposal.** AT confirmed that she would put together an initial written assessment for CAP179 and will circulate this once completed to the GSG. The GSG suggested that, once drafted,

## Governance Standing Group (GSG)

the IWA could be compared to the IWA for the equivalent BSC modification proposal, P250.

**Action: AT to produce and circulate the CAP179 initial written assessment**

### 4 “Least Worst” Option/Abstaining in Voting Paper

189. MK presented her paper for discussion on Recommendation Votes for Working Groups and the Amendments Panel (the paper is published on the GSG page of National Grid's website). MK discussed her concerns that at the end of the Working Group process, Working Group members are asked to vote on which option "best" facilitates the applicable CUSC objectives. There is often a discrepancy between voting during this stage, as some Working Group members abstain from this part of the vote because they do not like any of the options, whereas others may choose the "least worst" option because they believe they have to make a choice. This seems to be inconsistent and may result in the outcome of the vote not correctly reflecting the views of the Working Group members. The GSG noted that this may also be an issue for the CUSC Panel Recommendation vote. It was agreed that abstentions could be avoided if the CUSC baseline were included as an option during the "best" element of the voting process.
190. KC queried whether, to help the Authority, Working Group and Panel members should rank all options in the order in which they facilitate the Applicable Objectives compared to the baseline and each other. Where no options were supported over the baseline, the baseline would therefore be given as the 'best' option, then the option that was 'least worst', followed by the next least worst and so on. The rest of the GSG did not believe this was necessary.
191. MK also noted that it was not always clear from a Working Group report why a member had chosen to abstain. AT commented that NGET are more stringent about recording the reasons given by CUSC Panel Members during a Panel Recommendation Vote and that this is recorded within the CUSC Amendments Panel minutes. KC informed the GSG that the informal BSC rule is that members should only abstain where they feel they do not have enough information to take a view (which would suggest that further work is needed). This is particularly true of Working Group members, because they are the technical experts. KC also noted that it is not BSC working practice to attribute specific votes to individual Working Group members, as they are required to be impartial and should feel able to express their personal views rather than those of their employer. BSC reports therefore note whether a recommendation is unanimous or made by majority (and whether this is a large or slight majority). All views are recorded in full, but (with the exception of the Proposer's) are anonymised, so that the Panel and the Authority can make decisions based on the strength of argument.
192. The GSG discussed that detailed Working Group voting was recorded within the Transmission Access Working Group reports (CAPs161 – CAP166). AT agreed to speak to Hedd Roberts regarding the process used to determine the voting methodology; whether it was a simple majority.
- Action: AT to speak to Hedd Roberts regarding TAR WG voting process**
193. The GSG debated the position of the Chairman regarding voting, GG believed that the Chairman should work impartially and if there is no majority, the

## Governance Standing Group (GSG)

Chairman would go with the status quo. PB stated as this is not codified it should be covered in the Terms of Reference for the Working Group.

194. MK highlighted that the standard Working Group Terms of Reference template is currently not available on the National Grid website.

**Action: BV to publish Working Group Terms of Reference on National Grid website**

195. The GSG agreed that the standard Working Group Terms of Reference should be updated to include the voting process as detailed below. The revised version should be agreed by the GSG at the February meeting prior to being taken to the Amendments Panel for approval.

196. **Abstention.** The Terms of Reference should set out examples where an individual might abstain from voting (look at the words from the BSC and give the reasons why), for example where insufficient work has been completed, however the ToR should also make clear that if an individual has concerns of this nature, they should raise these with the Chairman at the earliest opportunity and before the vote takes place.

197. **Clearer voting procedures** which would include the CUSC baseline as an option when choosing which option "Best" facilitates the applicable CUSC objectives.

198. **Role of Chair.** It should be clear that the Chair would have no vote, casting or otherwise.

199. GG requested that a Working Group report should make it clear where a potential conflict of interest arises, for example where the Working Group Chair uses their powers to put through a WG Alternative Amendment or WG Consultation Alternative Request, against the majority vote of the Working Group, which was raised by the organisation for whom the Chair works.

**Action: AT to make changes to the Terms of Reference to incorporate the comments above to be agreed at February GSG meeting**

### 5 Proposed changes to the GSG Governance Amendment Proposal

200. BA gave a presentation to the GSG detailing the outstanding actions from the original Amendment Proposal discussed at the November 2009 GSG meeting. BA explained the proposed changes to the original amendment resulted from National Grid's further consideration of the issues raised. Following discussion of the points raised, the GSG agreed the following changes:

201. **Proposal I:** Extend the right to raise a Working Group Consultation Alternative Request to BSC Parties and the National Consumer Council (NCC) only.

**Proposal II:** Extend the right to self nominate to be a Working Group Member to the BSC Party and the NCC only.

**Proposal III:** Amendment Panel to reconsider and discuss further. GSG also agreed to take this out from the original Amendment Proposal to avoid delaying the development of the other proposals.

**Proposal IV:** Agreed to keep the current position which is to remove the right for a Working Group member to invite an observer to speak.

## Governance Standing Group (GSG)

**Proposal V:** To allow only a Chairman to invite an observer to a Working Group meeting as opposed to a Chairman and Working Group member.

202. In addition to the above proposal the GSG recommended that the Amendment Proposal have provisions to enable a Chairman to remove a disruptive observer from Working Group meeting.

**Action: BA to amend the Amendment Proposal to reflect the changes discussed at this meeting and circulate to the GSG**

### **6 Any Other Business**

203. No other business was discussed.

### **7 Next Meeting**

204. The next GSG meeting will be held at 10.00am on **25 February 2010** at National Grid House, Warwick Technology Park, Gallows Hill, Warwick, CV34 6DA.